

To Accreditation Council
Of Eurasian Center for Accreditation
And Quality Assurance
In Higher Education and Health Care
03.03.2022

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
BASED ON THE RESULTS OF EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAMME 7R01142 – Clinical Pharmacology
OF NEI "KAZAKHSTAN-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY) IN
MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION**

period of external expert evaluation: February 15-18, 2022

Almaty, 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1.	Presentation of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology"	4
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	6
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions	6
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	12
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology"	17
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology"	33
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	34
8.	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational programme of the Residency in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology"	35
9.	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	36
10.	Attachment 3. Organization Visit Programme	37

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES of RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
GD RoK	Government Decree of the RK
NEI	Non-State educational institution
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health care
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
HEI	higher education institution
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education
SC	Scientific Council
AC	Academic Council
CEP	Committee of Educational Programmes
AMP	Administrative and managerial staff
TS	Teaching staff
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
EP	Educational programme
DP&CEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CIS	Control measuring instruments
QEP	Quality of the educational process
AC	Attestation Committee
RIWP	Resident Individual work plan
RIWT	Resident independent work under the supervision of a teacher
IWS	Independent work of the student (resident)
EPL	Curriculum
WC	Work Curriculum
TEP	Typical educational plan
RW	Research work
EEC	External expert commission
NLA	Normative legal acts
EMS	Emergency medical services
PHC	Primary health care
EDM	Emergency and Disaster Medicine
MTB	Material and technical base
PD	Profiling Disciplines

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 02 dated 02.02.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" in the period 15-18 February 2022, as follows:

№ п/п	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the Medical University of Karaganda, member of the International Surgery Society
2	Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Research, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with the Course of Forensic Medicine of the St. Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the New York Academy of Sciences
3	Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Economics, Management and Medical Law, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention and the Faculty of Higher Nursing Education of the Volga Research Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod
4	Kazakh Academic Expert	Tuleutaeva Raykhan Esenzhanovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pharmacology named after MD, prof. Musina M.N. NJSC "Semey Medical University"
5	Employers' representative	Zhazira Dzhumabekovna Moldabaeva	deputy Chief Physician for pediatric SCP at the Medical Center "City Polyclinic No.29"
6	Resident Representative	Ermekbai Aibek Amanzholuly	Resident of the second year of study in the specialty "Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including pediatric" of the Asfendiyarov KazNMU"

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the ECAQA (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017). The ECAQA report contains an assessment of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the ECAQA for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical

Pharmacology" and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, bin	Non-governmental educational institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", 970 240 002 300
Management body	The supreme body – the general meeting of participants Executive body – Rector Control body – Audit Commission Collegiate body – Academic Council
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Created on	1992 y.
Location and contact details	71, Torekulova str., Almaty
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2016 y.
Duration of training	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	3
Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	1
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	2/2, 50%

Among the medical universities of the country, the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" is an educational institution that trains competitive, demanded in the labor market personnel, provides higher and postgraduate medical education with a state diploma.

The self-assessment of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" was carried out within the framework of the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan and was based on the results of work for the period 2019 - 2021.

The external audit was conducted in accordance with the approved external audit programme on February 15-18, 2022. The expert group visited the clinical base of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology, which is based in the City Polyclinic No.12 of Almaty. As part of the audit, a practical training was attended, during which the student demonstrated good theoretical training, mastered practical skills and his achievements during the implementation of the educational programme, performed by the staff of the department. In conditions when in the majority of medical and preventive institutions of the country in the presence of a full-time medical unit of a clinical pharmacologist, the Department of Clinical Pharmacology of the NEI "KRMU" provides significant support to several

clinics of the city, in which the work of a clinical pharmacologist is performed by the faculty of the department with the involvement of residents in joint practical activities.

When conducting interviews with students, graduates and employers, a high appreciation was received from all interested parties, in terms of teaching and assessment methods, in terms of students' mastering of competencies, the demand for graduates of this specialty and their achievements both during training and in the course of practical activities after graduation from residency.

During the visit of the EEC, the University demonstrated that it is a medical education organization with all the necessary material, technical and scientific and educational base, highly qualified pedagogical and scientific personnel (license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010). For all years, since 1992, the University has been training competitive specialists in the following levels: undergraduate, internship, residency and master's degree on the basis of existing state licenses for the levels of higher and postgraduate, additional education in accordance with the current State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, implements programmes of additional education.

Over the years, the university has shaped its brand, traditions and values, continuing to follow the course to universities of the international level, indicated by the country's leadership. The principles of the Bologna process, the credit system of training is implemented in all specialties of the bachelor's degree.

Since 2011, the University publishes a quarterly journal "Actual problems of theoretical and clinical medicine".

In accordance with Article 23 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", the University was accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and scientific-technical activity, certificate number MK series No. 005269 dated 08.10.2018.

The university's budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (a state order for the training of specialists of higher, postgraduate and additional education), the provision of paid educational services.

The financing of the university is stable and contributes to improving the material and technical base and increasing the contingent.

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. Three PMCs were demonstrated that provide significant support to practical health care in remote areas of the region.

In order to develop cooperation, 30 agreements, agreements and memoranda with Kazakhstan and foreign higher educational institutions have been concluded.

In 2012, the University successfully passed the State Attestation of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in 2018 and 2020 – preventive control of the Committee for ensuring control in the field of education and science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

According to the requirements of the time, the training of students is carried out in Kazakh, Russian and English. Form of study – full-time, daytime. Over 29 years of activity, the University has trained more than 6,000 specialists, all of whom occupy a worthy place in the practical health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In 2016, the University was accredited by the Independent Kazakhstan Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (certificate of institutional accreditation dated May 31, 2016 IA, No.0066, valid from May 31, 2016 to June 01, 2021). Also in 2021, the University was accredited by the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health Care» (certificate of international institutional accreditation dated June 17, 2021 IA00039, valid from June 17, 2021 to June 16, 2026)

Members of the EEC held interviews with the administrative and administrative staff, employees of various departments, heads of departments and teaching staff, studying in the residency

of all specialties, a meeting with the resident asset was organized separately. During the interview, it was obvious that the educational process, the achievement of all competencies by students, corresponds to the stated mission, vision of the educational institution and is attractive for faculty and residents among equals in the country.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

To date, the accreditation of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" has not been carried out.

2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions

Self-assessment report 7R01142 - Clinical Pharmacology (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 94 pages of the main text, attachments on 28 pages, copies or electronic versions of all supporting documents, for all 9 standards located at <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1bSVjvUJD9rUsDuEVW8Nssn7foK4fTU1r>

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the head, Rector of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" Dzhanakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich, MD, professor, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 6 members of the internal self-assessment commission with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme - Bekmagambetova Zh.M., Head of the Strategic Development and Accreditation Department (e-mail: strategy@medkrmu.kz).

The self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" was carried out on the basis of Order No. 26-02-50/1-n/k dated 01.07.2021 "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the process of self-assessment of educational programmes".

The report was reviewed by R.E. Tuleutayeva, Accreditation Expert, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, including the following:

Standards	Reviewer's recommendations
3	It is recommended to specify the training methods, review the assessment methods and use the assessment sheets corresponding to the profile of the specialty. It is necessary to improve the methodology for evaluating test tasks for reliability, validity using appropriate programmes.
4	Include resident association representatives in the process of development of resident admission and selection policies.
6	It is recommended to establish cooperation with universities of Kazakhstan, near and far abroad. Academic mobility of residents and TS should be planned and implemented. Expand access to UpToDate, Cochrane Library databases to implement EP
8	It is recommended to improve financing mechanisms for the development of academic mobility of faculty and residents, participation in international events, publication activity.

Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly and additions were made to the recommendations of the reviewers.

In all standards, the real practice of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for the training of residents in the specialty "7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology "is given, taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2021, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, the tables contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of the external expert evaluation

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health Care» No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved on 02.02.2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Rector of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" Dzhainakbayev N.T., Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor. Dates of the visit to the organization: February 16-18, 2022

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

The participation of a foreign expert Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov, MD, Professor, Vice-Rector of the St. Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation is provided on the zoom platform (video recordings are archived in the accreditation body).

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 12 people in total;
- interviews with residents – 93 people;
- study of the [website www.krmu.edu.kz](http://www.krmu.edu.kz);
- interviews with 44 residents, 13 employers and 43 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents – 113 and 200, respectively
- in the course of the external evaluation programme, a practical lesson was attended in the discipline "Evaluation of the use of medicinal products and clinical and pharmacological examination. Adverse Drug Reactions. Teacher Akshalova A.G., 21-01 CF group, resident of Nurgozha Nazira Moldabekovna. The lesson was held on the basis of the City Polyclinic No.12, the topic of the practical lesson: "Types of adverse drug reactions. Mechanisms of their development".

- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 21 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members

№	Full name	Job Title
1	Zhumatova Myra Gabbasovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Department
2	Mukhitova Dinara Turegeldinovna	senior Lecturer of the Department
3	Nurgozha Nazira Moldabekovna	Resident for 1 year
4	Mamaeva Asem	graduated in 2018

Thus, when implementing the activities of the external evaluation programme, namely, based on the results of the interview with the first head of the organization, members of the Academic Council, the Committee of Educational Programmes, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The strategic plan of the organization for the period 2019-2025 was reviewed, including such areas as "Benchmarking", "Accreditation of competitors", "Risks", "Strategic goals", "Indicators of strategic development", which confirms the fulfillment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

In the documents of the organization there are EP, syllabuses, EMCD, where the goal is defined, the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work is taken into account. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending a practical lesson on the topic "Types of adverse drug reactions. Mechanisms of their development", experts received convincing data that training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of lesson residents answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have an opportunity to improve skill on clinical and pharmacological examination of use of medicines. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since experts studied the code of ethics (Code of honor of the teacher, Order No. 347/1, approved on 12.12.20217) and during the interview, the residents noted that they were informed about the content of this document.

While attending a practical lesson and talking to residents, experts saw that the organization contributes to the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

A review of the controls (350 tests, 50 mini-clinical exam assignments) showed that the organization had implemented an appropriate evaluation policy to assess the learning achievements of residents in a comprehensive manner. During the interview, the residents spoke about the evaluation forms, such as the evaluation of the case, the evaluation of presentations, the evaluation of communication skills and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in PL-03-18-04 Regulation on the Test Committee approved under No. 2 on October 28, 2021 and during the period of

work of the organization of education there were no precedents for appeal. Thus, compliance with standard 3 has been established.

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with an employee Bekmagambetova Zh.M., Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Accreditation, the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operating plans, annual reports, provisions of divisions, contracts with teachers and residents, contracts with clinical bases and educational and methodological documentation (working curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents and information for entrants to the residency, questions for the entrance exam, which is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with Orakbay L.Zh., Head of the Residency Department.

The conversation with Orakbay L.Zh.- Head of the Residence Department, Dossayeva S.T. – Chief Specialist of the Residence Department included such issues as "how the entrance examination to the Residence is held", "how the resident is provided with a component of choice", "how the appeal is carried out", "how you receive feedback from interested parties", "whether residents participate in advisory bodies", etc., and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (12 people in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, the information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most part-time employees do not know the teaching methodology. For this purpose, in NEI "KRMU" training at School of the teacher is carried out. The department includes in the work plan of the department in the IWP of the teaching staff on a mandatory basis at this school. Every 5 years, each teacher undergoes training in pedagogical and clinical areas.

Interviews with 43 teachers, including 43 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in education management, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to equipment, sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with standard 4.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation, diagnostic and treatment protocols, international clinical guidelines, and work with databases.

During visits to clinical bases, experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, enough time for patient supervision, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", availability of international databases of professional literature. However, students in the NEI "KRMU" do not have access to the databases UpToDate, Cochrane Library. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, residents would like to participate in conferences and forums, holding international events.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the ability to participate in research, funding, demonstrated proficiency in English when answering the questions of a foreign expert Nasyrov Ruslan Abdullayevich and Pozdeeva Tatyana Vasilyevna, Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, the results of assessment of residents-checklists, the results of questionnaires of residents).

Interviews with 13 employers were conducted offline and included such issues as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 80% employment of graduates of residency, etc.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical base - City Polyclinic No.12 was visited, and employees of the organization of education provide collegial and ethical relations with medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients are provided, modern equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and clinical mentors provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

During the interviews with residents and faculty, the analysis of teaching methods and evaluation, recommendations were made for the revision of both teaching methods and evaluation methods. In particular, some checklists do not give a clear idea for assessing the knowledge and skills of the resident, the questions in them are generalized, blurred, the resident clinical pharmacologist needs to assess knowledge and skills in relation to the specifics of the specialty. The checklist for assessing the presentation in the residency is not relevant at all, since the skills of making presentations are mastered by students in the bachelor's degree and have clear criteria.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, interviews, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme 7R01142 – Clinical Pharmacology for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed, and Chairperson Yermek Meiramovich Turgunov held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council on the accreditation period – 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the Chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

Conclusion: EP 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology" of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" meets the requirements of the "Standard for accreditation of educational programmes of the residency of medical organizations of education" of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health Care.

4. Results of the survey.

The ECAQA observer conducted an online questionnaire on 16-18.02.2022 at <https://webanketa.com/>.

The resident survey includes 39 questions. In total 200 people (in total 629 residents for the current year) answered.

The first question of the questionnaire "I am" showed that from 200 respondents more than a half of respondents are residents of the 1st year of training (103 people/51,5%), 67 people (33,5%) in the second year of training and only 7 people noted that they are graduates of KRMU, i.e. students of 3 courses (3,5%).

The vast majority of respondents, 175 people (87.5%), would recommend studying at KRMU to their environment, 22 people (11%) partially agreed with this statement, 1 person (0.5%) will not recommend this UNIVERSITY completely and 2 people (1%) found it difficult to answer.

178 residents (89%) believe that programme managers and teachers are aware of students' learning problems, 18 people (9%) partially support this statement, completely disagree and questioned the answer for 2 students (1%).

When asked about the fact that programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (academic council, academic council, committees of educational programmes) 179 residents (89.5%) answered in the affirmative, 5 people (2.5%) wrote that they are not involved in advisory bodies, 6 people (3%) answered "I do not know anything about it", "I doubt with the answer" and 4 people (2%) chose the answer "sometimes".

The assessment of satisfaction with the conditions for training and the equipment of training rooms and classrooms of the KRMU showed that 175 people out of 200 (87.5%) were completely satisfied with the provided conditions, 21 people (10.5%) were partially satisfied, 2 people (1%) were not completely satisfied and 1 person (0.5%) chose the answers «partially dissatisfied».

The overwhelming majority also answered positively to the question whether the conditions for rest and meals for students (recreation rooms, benches/gazebos on the territory, canteen) were created in this educational organization, 171 people (85.5%), 12 people (6%) partially agreed and 7 people (3.5%) completely disagreed with this statement.

The equipment of office equipment in classrooms and on clinical bases fully satisfies 165 respondents (82.5%), partially 29 people (14.5%), completely does not satisfy 3 people (1.5%), partially disagree with the statement of 2 people (1%) and doubted the answer of 1 resident (0.5%).

174 residents (87%) believe that teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, 23 students (11.5%) partially agree, 2 people (1%) completely disagree with this statement and 1 resident (0.5%) doubted the answer.

Out of the surveyed residents, 176 people (88%) noted that in the KRMU there is access to the participation of students in research work, 22 people (11%) partially agree, 1 person (0.5%) completely disagree, 1 person (0.5%) doubted the answer to this statement.

The majority of residents were satisfied with the resources of the library fund, which is 171 people (85.5%). At the same time, 22 people (11%) are partially satisfied, 6 people (3%) are not completely satisfied, and 1 resident (0.5%) does not answer this question.

176 residents (88%) were completely satisfied with access to electronic educational resources, 18 people (9%) were partially satisfied, 4 people (2%) were completely dissatisfied with access to educational resources, and 1 person (0.5%) were not partially satisfied and did not respond.

In the KRMU, 170 people (85%) were completely satisfied with the availability of medical services for a student, 22 students (11%) were partially satisfied, they were not satisfied with the availability of medical services and did not give an answer to 4 people (2%).

When conducting the survey, 183 people (91.5%) were satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators, research managers, 14 people (7%), 2 people (1%) were not completely satisfied, 1 resident (0.5%) did not have an answer.

191 students (95.5%) noted that teachers and employees of the organization of education respect students. 7 people (3.5%) disagree with this statement, 2 residents (1%) did not have an answer.

179 people (89.5%) of residents agree with the statement that social programmes to support students exist and are implemented in the organization of education. 6 people (3%) did not agree, 9

people (4.5%) did not hear about such programmes, 2 people (1%) answered "what is it" and 4 people (2%) did not answer.

When asked about the availability of a career counselling service in an educational institution, 183 residents (91.5%) responded positively, 2 people (1%) gave a negative answer, 11 people (5.5%) did not hear about this organization 14 people (2%) doubted the answer.

The question in the questionnaire that in the organization of education the system of independent training of students, residents, undergraduates, doctoral students and listeners at the majority of pupils is established, 181 people (90,5%), gave a positive answer. In part, 15 people (7.5%) agreed with this statement, 2 residents (1%) disagreed completely, and doubted the answer of 2 people (1%).

174 residents (87%) rated the organization of clinical (practical) training as "excellent", "good" was noted by 23 people (11.5%), 2 people answered "satisfactory", 1 (0.5%) unsatisfactory.

When asked whether there is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, clinical rounds, clinical reviews, surgical assistance, work in laboratories and in pharmaceutical production), 190 residents (95%) gave an answer "agree completely", 8 people (4%) "agree partially", 2 people (1%) "DO not agree completely".

185 students (92.5%) were fully satisfied with the schedule of classes in the disciplines of the educational programme, 14 people (7%) were partially satisfied, 1 resident (0.5%) was not satisfied.

180 students (90%) are completely satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills, 19 people (9.5%) are partially satisfied, 1 resident (0.5%) would like to change them.

To the question, the content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty meets my expectations 185 residents (92.5%) gave the answer "yes, completely", 14 people (7%) "partially", 1 person (0.5%) "no".

181 residents (90.5%) noted that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods regularly, 14 people (7%) sometimes, 4 people (2%) rarely and 1 resident (0.5%) answered "never used".

When asked how often a teacher is late for class, 187 people (93.5%) answered that "there was no such thing", 10 people (5%) answered "sometimes", 2 people answered "systematically" and 1 resident (0.5%) "I do not know what to answer".

180 people (90%) noted that constantly after the end of classes the teacher conducts feedback (listens to opinion, carries out mini-questionnaire, carries out work on mistakes), 15 people (7.5%) answered that sometimes, 3 people (1.5%) – seldom, 2 people (1%) never.

On a question of the questionnaire "The teacher (mentor, curator) of this organization of education is for me an example as the professional doctor, the person (ethics, communications, appearance, speech)» completely agree 191 respondents (95,5%), 3 residents completely disagree, not all teachers of this organization of education noted 5 people (2,5%), 1 resident doubted with the answer.

To the question, 191 residents (95.5%) answered "completely satisfied", 7 people (3.5%) "partially", 2 people (1%) "not completely satisfied".

187 students (93.5%) noted that they like to study in this educational institution, 11 people (5.5%) partially agree, 1 resident (0.5%) completely disagrees with this statement and 1 resident (0.5%) did not have an opinion.

195 people (97.5%) noted that they are satisfied with their relations with their fellow students, colleagues, medical personnel, 5 residents (2.5%) responded partially.

183 people (91.5%) noted that they did not personally experience negative attitudes of teachers, 10 residents (5%) answered "ever, deservedly", 6 people (3%) answered "yes, unfairly", 1 resident (0.5%) did not respond.

180 students (90%) are satisfied that they are studying in this educational institution, 18 residents (9%) answered yes, partially, 1 resident (0.5%) answered no, disappointed, 1 resident (0.5%) answered I do not know how to answer.

All students, 200 people (100%) noted the accessibility of the management of the organization of education for students.

148 students (74%) are engaged in scientific work, 21 residents (10.5%) are not engaged in

science, 2 residents (1%) doubted with the answer, 21 residents (10.5%) plan to start, 7 residents (3.5%) wrote that they are in search of a research topic, 1 resident (0.5%) replied that he does not want to engage in research.

When asked the questionnaire, "Do you personally have printed works (articles, abstracts, reviews) published during your studies in this educational institution?", 108 people (54%) answered yes, one. 14 residents (7%) noted more than one job, 12 people (6%) not one, 48 people (24%) plan to publish in the near future, 9 residents (4.5%) answered "I just entered the training programme", 9 residents (4.5%) did not respond.

When asked the questionnaire, "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the specialty you have chosen?", 189 people (94.5%) answered "yes, I am sure of it", 3 people (1.5%) are not sure of it, 4 people (2%) answered "I can not answer this question yet", 3 residents (1.5%) answered "I would like to believe it" and 1 resident (0.5%) answered "I am beginning to doubt it".

186 students (93%) are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching, 12 people (6%) are partially satisfied, 2 people (1%) are dissatisfied with the organization of teaching.

179 respondents (89.5%) rated the work of the External Expert Commission on the accreditation of this organization of education positively, 15 people (7.5%) rated satisfactory, 6 people (3%) doubted with the answer.

176 people (88%) of residents agree with the statement that it is necessary to carry out accreditation of the organization of education or educational programmes. 15 people (7.5%) disagree, 2 people (1%) do not know what it is, 7 people (3.5%) doubted the answer.

On the question of the questionnaire, "Did managers and/or teachers involve you in activities to prepare for institutional or specialized (programme) accreditation?" 152 residents (76%) answered "yes, when preparing the self-assessment report", 12 residents (6%) answered "yes, for the organization of a meeting of external experts", 22 residents (11%) – "yes, at all stages of preparation", 1 resident (0.5%) – "yes, since I speak a foreign language", 2 residents (1%) answered that they refused to participate for a good reason, 7 people (3.5%) answered no and 4 residents (2%) noted in the questionnaire that they first heard about accreditation when the commission arrived.

Thus, the majority of students (from 88% and above) are completely satisfied with the organization and conduct of the educational process, social support, the availability of resources, and the material and technical base. Only 1-2% of residents noted their dissatisfaction, not involvement in all aspects of training in the residency.

The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions. In total 113 people answered, thus pedagogical experience till 5 years – till 5 years – 28,3%, 5-10 years - 22,12%, more than 10 years – 49.6%. 58.4%

74.3% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process in this educational institution, 22.1% are partially satisfied, 2.65% are partially dissatisfied.

86,7% noted that in this organization of education ethics and subordination in the relations between colleagues, teachers, the management are observed, 11,5%- agreed partially.

Completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this organization of education -75.2%, partially agree 23.0% partially disagree 1.8%.

70.8% of respondents noted that there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization, 22.1% partially agree, 2.6% partially agree, 1.8% completely disagree.

75.2% of respondents fully agree that in this organization of education they have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research, 16.8% partially agree, 3.5% partially disagree.

The salary suits completely 46,9% of respondents, disagree with it - 5,3%, more "Yes", than Isn't present - 27,4%, more, than Yes - 12,4%

Satisfied with the work of the HR service (personnel)- fully -83.2%, partially - 13.3%, completely not satisfied - 0.88%.

Training on courses (programmes) of professional development during this year passed - 49,6% of respondents, more than 5 years ago - 31,0%, don't remember when it was - 7,1%.

It is believed that the discipline taught by the respondent is provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment) - fully -73.5% of respondents, partially -22.1%, partially disagree -2.7%

In this organization of education have the opportunity to realize as a professional in the specialty completely -81.4%, partially agree-13.3%, partially disagree - 0.9%. Personally participated in the development of the educational programme in the discipline that is taught: yes, active-63.7% of the teaching staff, did not participate-15.0%, were only electives-7.1%, were not involved in the work-6.2%.

60.2% of respondents note the timeliness of the fulfillment of applications for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization, 7.9% - untimely, the long wait for the application note -6.2% and have no relation to it-15.0%

They noted that the organization of education supports the participation of teaching staff in conferences (international, republican) with the payment of travel, travel expenses, registration fee - 21.2% of teaching staff, payment of travel only - 2.7%, does not pay any expenses - 2.7%, did not contact the management in this regard-30.9%

We fully agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university to improve their practical skills - 85.8% of the teaching staff, partially agree -9.73%, doubt the answer - 4.42%

The publication activity of the TS is assessed on a scale of 5 points (from 1- low to 5 -high) - 17.1% as 1, as 2 -7.1%, 3-19.5%, 4-23.9%, 5-26.6%, did not give an answer-17.7%

On the question "Are social support programmes for teachers implemented in the educational organization?" replied: yes, there are such programmes 38.9%, yes, I have already used this - 2.65%, no-3.5%, I do not know about this - 44.3%, I doubt with the answer - 10.6%.

65.5% of respondents answered that yes, heads of the organization systematically listen to their opinion regarding questions on the educational process, research, clinical work, yes, sometimes noted 18.6%, quite rarely - 0.88%

To the question: What teaching methods do you most often use in the process of teaching students (bachelors, residents, undergraduates)? The students noted that the lectures are used by - 48.7%, oral analysis of the topic of the lesson - 72.6%, rewriting of thematic information from monographs - 10.6%, problem-oriented training - 40.7%, interactive training - 46.9%, performance of abstracts - 34.5%, practical classes on clinical skills in the educational and clinical center - 56.6%, analysis of situational tasks -75.2%, compilation and solution of cases - 38.9%, oral survey of students - 61.1%, solution of tests - 48.7%, work in small groups - 53.9%, written completion of tasks - 28.3%

We fully agree that this questionnaire is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the organization's activities 70.8% of the TS, partially agree -14.2%, partially disagree 0.9%, completely disagree 2.6%. On a question: Whether you personally were involved in actions on preparation for accreditation of educational programmes answered that yes, included in the internal commission on self-assessment-31,9% of faculty; yes, was engaged in technical support before a meeting of the external expert commission - 16,81%; wrote sections of the report on self-assessment - 12,4%; collected information for annexes to the report on self-assessment - 15,9%; no, wasn't involved in preparation of higher education institution to accreditation - 23,9%.

35.4% of respondents would like to personally become an expert on accreditation of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in higher Education and Health care, I am not interested in this issue - 32.7%, have already participated in the work of the accreditation commissions of this accreditation center - 4.4%.

Question: Do you think that the work of the external expert commission on accreditation can fully cover all issues related to the quality of implementation of the educational programmes of the university answered - Yes, since the visit of the commission is preceded by the stage of self-assessment of the programme and writing a report -53.1 %; Yes, the commission investigates all the

main processes of implementation of programmes - 35.4%; The programme of the visit of the commission is saturated and covers all key aspects of education - 28.3%; The programme of the commission includes interviews and interviews with stakeholders, allowing to draw conclusions about the quality of training - 34.5%; I do not think that a three-day visit of the commission will assess the quality of programmes - 5.3%; Everything depends on the professionalism and competence of accreditation experts - 22.1%; There are more effective assessment mechanisms, for example, state certification and audits -1.8%

Respondents noted what activities of external expert work on accreditation are most important and allow to obtain evidence of implementation of the Accreditation Standards: Interview with university management -7.96%; Interview with heads of educational programmes (heads of departments, deans)13.3 Interviews with students-11.5%; Interviews with programme graduates - 3.5%; Interviews with representatives of employers - 1.8%; Visiting practice bases - 3.5%; Survey of educational resources - 0.88%; Study of educational and methodological documentation - 0%; Interviews with teachers - 1.8%; Review of the self-assessment report of the programme - 0%; Attendance at practical classes - 2.7%; Study of administrative documentation - 0.88%; All of the above - 45.1%

Thus, the results of the survey of teaching staff as a whole show satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the possibility of implementing their scientific, clinical, pedagogical skills, as well as indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology"

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

Evidence of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement and deliverables

All work on the implementation of EP 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology" at the Department of Clinical Pharmacology is carried out in accordance with the mission, "Strategy of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for 2019-2025", which was discussed at the Academic Council dated December 26, 2019, Protocol No.5, based on the Model Residency Curriculum in the specialty "Clinical Pharmacology", approved by the Order of the Acting Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 916 dated November 23, 2010, on the basis of the State requirements for the minimum content of additional education programs of the Republic of Kazakhstan – 2009, approved on November 26, 2009 No. 778.

All interested parties – heads of departments and divisions of the university, faculty, students, graduates, employer organizations, health and education management bodies, representatives of the public actively participate in the implementation of the Mission and goals of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity".

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" is studying the needs of practical health care in specialists, which is the basis of an effective system of professional training.

During the external evaluation, it was confirmed that the university has introduced corporate governance based on the principles of collegiality and openness of its decisions, separation of governing bodies and their responsibility, financial transparency. It is good practice to hold purposeful meetings with employers in the coordination of educational programmes, catalogues of elective disciplines (CED). During the interview with the representatives of employers, we received feedback that they are members of the Clinical Council of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity", at the meetings of which issues related to the implementation of the Mission are discussed.

In order to assess the objectives and policy in the field of quality, as well as in order to improve the EP, the university conducts questionnaires of students, graduates and employers, which was confirmed, inter alia, in the course of interviews with all participants in the educational programme.

The University management plays an important role in the adoption and approval of the quality assurance policy of the EP. In addition, all employees of the University without exception necessarily undergo the procedure of acquaintance with the Quality Assurance Policy, as well as in their daily activities are guided by its provisions, which was confirmed during an interview with heads of departments, faculty and administrative and managerial personnel. The website of the University, the general management of the University, the availability of an approved paper version by departments allow to ensure the accessibility and transparency of the Policy.

To improve the quality of educational services and determine satisfaction with the quality of education, annual questionnaires of residents and graduates are conducted; training of university staff on medical education is regularly held at the School of Teachers; a strategic partnership on quality issues with medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan and Russia was established (FSBEI HE "Saratov State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, FSBEI HE "Omsk State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, FSBEI HE "St. Petersburg State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation)

To meet the needs of the students of the residency of the "Clinical Pharmacology" department, the department has a sufficient material and technical base that provides all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, practical work of the resident provided for by the curriculum of the university, classrooms equipped with modern computers and appropriate software for teaching.

The objectives and final results of the residency of EP 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology" correspond to the mission, strategic plan, goals and objectives of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" and fully comply with the requirements of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, allow meeting the needs of the residency students to obtain relevant qualifications and competencies.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

To form and develop the professionalism and professional autonomy of students in the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity", the criteria for 7 disciplines of the mandatory component are used, including patient supervision, communication and collaboration, safety and quality, training and development. For example, WB-3 Safety and quality: able to assess risks and use the most effective methods to ensure a high level of safety and quality of medical care, WB-4 Public health: able to act within the legal and organizational framework of the health care system of the Republic of Kazakhstan in its specialty, work as part of interprofessional teams to implement the policy of strengthening the health of the nation and WB-6 Training and development: able to learn independently and train other members of the professional team, actively participate in discussions, conferences and other forms of continuous professional development.

Thus, as a result of training, the resident of EP 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" receives a holistic vision of processes, determines an individual approach to patients. Practical skills are practiced by residents in accordance with the list of such in the SCES, on-duty duties are carried out by residents independently under the supervision of a mentor.

The "Rules of the internal order for students", "Academic policy" and the agreement for the provision of educational services, which is concluded with each student when enrolling in the University, regulate the relationship between the participants in the educational process. Residents have the right to receive additional educational services, knowledge according to their needs on a paid basis; the possibility of free use of information resources at the University, the opportunity to engage in research activities. Academic policy of the University, issues of academic mobility, on-site training of interns and residents (the provision on on-site training in internship and residency, approved by the decision of the Academic Council dated 29.08.2019, Minutes No. 1) are defined in the relevant document.

In the process of evaluation at the end of the course of study or mastering a specific discipline, residents participate in a questionnaire, where they can express their thoughts and wishes for improving the educational process. Residents and the rector's blog, dean's office, telephone hotline are available, where residents can transmit their proposals and comments on the organization of the educational process (class schedule, etc.), the training programme for elective disciplines, the list of

elective disciplines, the library fund and other issues directly related to the learning process. (<https://krmu.edu.kz/blog-rektora/>, hotline phone +7 (771) 495-60-51, +7 (778) 188-54-48)

1.3 Learning outcomes

The final results are prescribed in EP 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology", developed within the framework of the SCES (Order No.647 in the 2020 revision) and the Qualification Characteristics of a Doctor (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. KR DSM-305/2020 "On Approval of the Nomenclature of Specialties and Specializations in the Field of Health, Nomenclature and Qualification Characteristics of Health Care Workers"), which takes into account the main final results of training of a resident. In the process of preparing a resident, a skill and a need for lifelong learning are formed.

1.3 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

In the process of forming the mission of the EP, all stakeholders are involved: students, teachers, clinical mentors attracted from clinical bases, administrative staff, advisory bodies of the MEO, graduates, which leads to a correct understanding of it due to the correct wording.

The EP, its goals, final learning outcomes were discussed and corrected at the level of: student audience, graduates (discussion of opportunities), department employees (discussion in the working group, at the meeting of departments / courses), at the meeting of the CEP (dated 14.05.2020 No.5), at the Academic Council (dated 28.08.2020 No.5) and the Academic Council of the University (dated 12.08.2020 No.5).

An external review of the EP was received and then adjusted with the participation of external reviewers: employers (including potential), National socio-professional associations, health care organizations.

The system of collecting and analyzing feedback from consumers through internal and external monitoring works well in the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity". The following departments are involved in the implementation of monitoring – QMS department, CEP, EMA, QC, CEP, scientific department, clinical department.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17.

Standard 1: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: No

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Evidence of compliance:

2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" has developed a model of a modular-competence approach to the training of residents, that is, a model for the organization of the educational process, based on the unity of modular teaching technologies and ECTS credits, as units of measurement of the resident's educational load, necessary for the assimilation of content modules. The credit and modular system of organizing the educational process provides for: a modular structure of the educational programme; the use of credit units (credits) to assess labor intensity; the use of point-rating systems for assessing knowledge; the participation of a resident in the formation of an individual curriculum; an increase in the share of self-learning in the educational process; an increase in the flexibility of educational programmes.

In the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity", the sequence of passing modules/disciplines is observed, taking into account the pre- and post-requisites when compiling the learning path. The content of the pre- and post-stroke disciplines is aimed at achieving knowledge, skills and abilities, which provides a step-by-step approach to their study.

2.2 Scientific method

Residents of EP 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" are involved throughout the training period in the scientific work that they perform under the guidance of a specially appointed mentor from among experienced doctors and under the supervision of the head of the residency. The implementation of the scientific component takes place within the framework of the classroom and extracurricular components of the EP when studying both mandatory and elective disciplines.

Due to the fact that the EP has been implemented since September 2021, the student has not yet published the results of scientific work and did not participate in conferences and forums.

2.3 Content of the residency programme

EP 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology" is designed for 140 credits: core disciplines – 132 credits, a component of choice – 4 credits, interim certification – 2 credits, final certification – 2 credits.

Profiling disciplines are represented by the disciplines: "Clinical pharmacology (general issues of clinical pharmacology and clinical-pharmacological characteristics of individual groups and drugs)" – 36 credits; "Evaluation of the use of drugs and clinical-pharmacological examination. Adverse drug reactions" – 13 credits; "Stages of clinical studies and regulation of drug provision in medical institutions" – 13 credits; "Search, evaluation and adaptation of international recommendations, guidelines and clinical protocols in the Republic of Kazakhstan" – 13 credits; "Clinical pharmacology and principles of rational pharmacotherapy in pediatric practice" – 13 credits; "Clinical pharmacology and principles of rational pharmacotherapy in certain diseases" – 35 credits; "Rational antibacterial therapy and antibiotic prophylaxis. Problems of antibiotic resistance" – 9 credits.

The component of choice (4 credits) can be selected from the following disciplines: "Personalized therapy" - 4 credits, "Clinical pharmacology in gerontology" – 4 credits, "Evidence-based medicine" – 4 credits.

The documents submitted for external experts, EEC, Syllabuses, CED are drawn up in accordance with the standard rules, the disciplines of EP are logically interrelated with each other and are consistently studied by residents.

2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

EP 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology" on the basis of the SCES of RoK provides for the study of the disciplines of the mandatory component and the component of choice. The content of the academic disciplines of the mandatory component is strictly regulated by the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and is reflected in the standard curricula of the disciplines of the specialty, and the content of the academic disciplines of the mandatory component of the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan of 2019 in the standard curricula.

During the training period, 1/3 of the total number of hours is allocated for independent work of the resident (IWR), which includes patient management (therapeutic and diagnostic, preventive work), participation in consultations of serious patients, duty in the departments of the clinic, mastering practical skills provided for by the training programme of EP 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology", preparation of abstracts, reports and presentations, work in the library, online classes, participation in scientific and practical conferences, in the work to promote a healthy lifestyle among patients.

The individual WEP is formed for the resident for the entire period of training, agreed with the curator, Candidate of Medical Sciences Zhumatova M.G. and approved by the head of the residency department. The individual work plan reflects the schedule of training, the mode of classes (number of hours per day), the list of sections and disciplines, the number of hours by sections and disciplines, types of training classes, knowledge control forms. The syllabuses indicate the place and time of the training consultation for the resident.

2.5 Organization of training

The Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs is the Vice-Rector responsible for the educational activities of the Residency. The Clinical Operations Department selects clinical bases and draws up contracts with clinical bases.

Clinical bases for students of the GP 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology" of the State Clinical Hospital No.2, Polyclinic No. 12, State Clinical Hospital No. 4, RSE on REM – a scientific center for dermatology and infectious diseases, where the maximum resident will be able to access patients in their profile of the educational programme of the residency. During the visit, the resident and the clinical mentor were acquainted with the clinical work of the resident.

2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

A practitioner who has the highest qualification category has the opportunity to become a mentor for a resident on a clinical basis. Under the supervision of a mentor, the resident clinical pharmacologist masters all the necessary practical skills in the diagnosis and treatment of various therapeutic pathologies, learns to work with medical documentation, and master's communication skills. Feedback from the mentor and the resident is mandatory, since daily interaction in the clinic implies an analysis of clinical thinking, an assessment of the resident's communication skills.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 31 standards: Fully 31.

Standard 2: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

3.1 Methods of evaluation

The University uses the methods of assessment of residents of EP 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology", such as a portfolio, assessment of scientific activities. Evaluation methods are developed by the department and reflected in the syllabuses approved at the meeting of both the department and the CEP.

The general policy, principles, methods of assessment of the residents of EP 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology" at the University are reflected in the Academic Policy of the University, the Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students in the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity". The list of mandatory disciplines for conducting the final control during the academic period is regulated by the completed disciplines, which are reflected in the WEP. The form of the midterm and final control is approved by the Academic Council. The department has a bank of test assignments, reviews for tests for each specialty. Questions for the formative exam. To ensure maximum objectivity and transparency of the evaluation process, the department has developed checklists for conducting current, midterm and final control of the discipline (Mini-cEX, Cbd, OSCE,) (cloud.krmu@gmail.com)

The resident in the specialty 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology" during the entire period of training forms a portfolio that corresponds to the final goals of the programme and contains uniform criteria for assessing the student's activities. The resident's portfolio consists of a resident's report; checklists with an assessment of practical activities, seminars, shifts, etc.; characteristics of a clinical mentor; information on achievements during the period of study in the residency (awards, certificates, conference programmes, abstracts of publications, video materials, letters of thanks, patient reviews, etc.).

The form of control and assessment of the resident's competence is determined by the department and approved at the CEP meeting.

The assessment is carried out according to the checklists developed by the staff of the department, implementing the training of residents in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology".

3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training

The self-assessment report presents a table on the comparability of learning outcomes and assessment methods, as well as teaching and learning methods used at the Department of Clinical Pharmacology. The assessment methods correspond to the teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all the competencies of students both during practical classes and during examinations. In the assessment of educational achievements, the control and measuring tools developed by the department are used, in various types (control questions, database of test tasks).

The methods used to assess the competencies of students in the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" are prescribed in syllabuses for the disciplines that are discussed and approved at departmental meetings, CEP, AC, SC. Evaluation criteria are presented in the syllabus on the university's website. Each stage of training, as a current, milestone and final control, allows you to assess the achievement of the final results of the resident's training. Scorecards have been submitted to EEC and can be found at cloud.krmu@gmail.com

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: fully - 7, partially – 4.

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) It is recommended to specify the training methods, review the assessment methods and use the assessment sheets corresponding to the profile of the specialty.

2) It is necessary to improve the methodology for evaluating test tasks for reliability, validity using appropriate programmes (conduct psychometric analysis).

Standard 4: STUDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

4.1 Admission and Selection Policy

Admission to the residency in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to education in the organization of education, implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education" dated October 31, 2018 No.600, the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan – 2020 and the Rules for admission to the residency of the NEI "KazRosmeditsinsky University" for the current academic year. The residency's specialties include clinical focus of education and in-depth specialized training in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology".

4.2 Number of residents

According to the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 606 "On approval of the average ratio of the number of students to teachers to calculate the total number of faculty of higher and (or) postgraduate education organizations...", the number of residents in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" per teacher is 1:3.

Every year, taking into account the needs for medical personnel, a request is sent to the University on the need for scientific and pedagogical personnel and clinical specialties of the residency in the National Research and Development Center of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Questions about admission to 44 educational programmes of the residency are posted on the university's website. Documents on training, working curricula, syllabuses, requirements and to the educational process, acts, orders, etc. are posted on the website of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University".

4.3 Resident support and advice

Employment and monitoring of university graduates is carried out by the Career Center, organized by the order of the rector. The Career Center promotes the employment of University graduates in conjunction with departments / courses; establishes close ties with HD bodies; coordinates the work of all structural units of the University on issues of vocational guidance.

The Career Centre annually carries out consultations with graduates, sends information to the authorized body for the distribution procedure. University graduates are in demand in the labor market, so the employment of residency graduates in 2016-2017 academic year amounted to 67 people or 91% of the employment of graduates. In the 2017-2018 academic year, 83 residents were distributed to medical organizations, which amounted to 66%. In 2018-2019, 79 residents were employed, which was 74%, in 2019-2020, 63 residents were employed, which was 94%. The first graduation of residents in the specialty 7R01142 "Clinical Pharmacology" is planned in 2023.

4.4 Representation of residents

Residents of the NEI "KazRosmeditsinsky University" have a real opportunity to participate in the organization of the specialty EP in the course of direct discussion and approval of syllabuses, at the level of developing an individual working curriculum and elective disciplines. Students of the residency actively participate in the development and evaluation of the EP, are members of the CEP, AC, SC, provide feedback.

Based on the results of the survey of residents, plans for corrective and preventive measures were developed, a proposal was made for the EP to provide greater autonomy and require greater activity during duty and during daily activities at the clinical base.

Residence students choose elective disciplines during the elective fair.

4.5 Working conditions

According to the NLA, resident doctors are granted vacations between academic periods. During the school year, at least seven weeks are set aside for holidays, with the exception of the final year.

Regardless of the specialty, residents are allowed to combine study with work (no more than 0.5 hours) in areas of activity close to his future specialty in his free time from study. To carry out this type of activity, the consent of the supervisor, the head of the department and the head of the residency department is required.

Residents of the 2nd year of study can conduct independent treatment activities in public and private medical institutions, in extracurricular time, if they have a specialist certificate.

The staff of the department develops comprehensive plans for work with each clinical base.

Residents of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology participate in all events held on a clinical basis: "Open Days", organization of training for nurses, in the organization and conduct of events for scientific and information exchange in the form of conferences, seminars, symposia, forums and other forms aimed at the exchange of experience, scientific and practical information, strengthening mutually beneficial relations, participate in the implementation of joint scientific and research projects.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully – 29, partially – 1.

Standard 4: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To include representatives of the resident association in the process of development of the policy of admission and selection of residents.

2) Involve students in the residency in the work of professional associations and public associations (Association of Clinical Pharmacologists and Pharmacists of Kazakhstan)

Standard 5: FACULTY

Evidence of compliance:

5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy

To perform EP and attract teaching staff, a competition is held to fill vacant positions, the procedure for which is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 23, 2015. No.230 "On Approval of the Rules for Competitive Substitution of Positions of Teaching Staff and Researchers of Higher Education Institutions» in accordance with the requirements of Order No.338 of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 13, 2009 "On Approval of Standard Qualification Characteristics of Positions of Pedagogical Workers and Equivalents" (with amendments and additions as of April 30, 2020)

It is important when hiring candidates that they meet the qualification requirements (clinical pharmacologist certificate).

In the 2020-2021 academic year, the total number of teaching staff at the Department of Clinical Pharmacology is 21 people, including 8 full-time employees and 13 part-time employees. Associate Professor 2, Candidates of Medical Sciences 5, Masters 2, Candidate of Biological Sciences, Professor of Rae - 1 person.

5.2 Teachers' obligations and development

The work of the teaching staff is planned in accordance with the individual plan of the teacher, which is discussed and approved at the meeting of the department participating in the training of residents in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology". Planning of teaching load of teaching staff is carried out in academic hours and is calculated by the contact time of the teacher with the flow, group, subgroup. For the direct management of the study group, the formation of an individual educational trajectory and preparation for the Final Certification, a curator is appointed from among the full-time faculty.

A system of professional and pedagogical improvement of the teaching staff of the NEI "KazRosmedunivert" works to develop the competencies of teaching staff: the Teacher's School, the Institute of Postgraduate Education, winter and summer schools organized by the TS, which contribute to the formation and development of the competence and potential of teaching staff.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 7 of the standards: fully 7.

Standard 5: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Evidence of compliance:

6.1 Logistics and equipment

In order to continuously improve the material and technical base, the University Administration allocates the necessary funds from the budget for the repair, technical equipment of educational, scientific and information activities, the purchase of furniture and educational equipment, the maintenance of engineering communications and networks of buildings and structures and the registration of buildings and structures. The university pays great attention to the working conditions of employees. The University periodically updates furniture, purchases hard and soft inventory, computer and office equipment, stationery, dummies, phantoms, laboratory and medical equipment, consumables, etc.

The Department of Academic Work (DAW), together with the library, conducts a biannual analysis of the needs and satisfaction in educational and methodological literature on specialties, levels and languages of study. Taking into account the needs of the departments and the analysis carried out, the AWD forms university-wide applications for the purchase and publication of textbooks and teaching aids for the new academic year.

The Department of Financial and Administrative Work analyzes information from departments, determines the expediency of planned purchases, repairs and acquisitions.

In general, the condition of the material and technical base of the university and the equipment of its educational and laboratory fund allow to ensure the educational process in accordance with the requirements of the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the State compulsory standards of education and local regulations of the university.

The material and technical base of the university's laboratories is being improved, modern equipment, reagents, technical means of training are being purchased. The University has 2 educational buildings with a total area of 12,706.4 m², a sports hall, 1 dormitory for 200 seats. Residency in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" has a significant material and technical base for the educational process. Equipped with all the necessary equipment, visual aids, educational material in electronic form, with methodological developments in each discipline, and innovative technologies for interactive teaching methods. This makes it possible to ensure that the educational process is conducted in accordance with educational standards. The University has a studio for video recording of classes and lectures, equipped with the best equipment.

6.2 Clinical Bases

Taking into account the needs of the university in the profile of patients, the level of medical care provided by medical institutions, the availability of study rooms, laboratories, agreements on cooperation with clinical bases are signed. Particular attention is paid to the availability of a certificate of accreditation from medical organizations, certifying the compliance of the clinical base activity with the accreditation standards in the field of health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan

To determine the compliance of the clinical bases of the university, internal and external audits are carried out, portfolio analyses and assessments, reports of residents and faculty members, internal departmental control are carried out.

Clinical bases of the University have a sufficient bed capacity, the Department of Clinical Pharmacology has a sufficient number of classrooms for conducting practical classes of independent work of residents.

Members of the EEC visited the clinical base of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology in City Polyclinic No.12. The training rooms of the clinical base are equipped with personal computers, multimedia installations, office equipment.

6.3 Information technology

Residents of the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" and teachers at clinical bases have access to information systems of health care, patient management, practice and work in medical care systems.

On March 16, 2020, the Department of Distance Education Technologies (hereinafter referred to as DDET) was established within the university structure to organize and support the educational process using distance education technologies. For effective communication and technical support of students and university teaching staff, the work of the call center of the DLT department was organized.

In August 2020, additional training on distance learning technologies was conducted for the university's teaching staff. In August-September 2020, a series of webinars on distance learning technologies for university students was held for students. In September 2020, online classrooms for students and faculty were created on the basis of the university.

In order to ensure the high quality of training, about 300 video lectures were shot in the video studio of the DLT department.

In January 2021, in accordance with the plan for improving the skills of university staff, the annual Winter School – 2021 for teaching staff was held, as part of which an online course "Distance educational technologies" was held.

In the second semester of the 2019-2020 academic year, 43 online courses for residents were created in cooperation with the DLT department. The standard course includes lectures, practical exercises, PSAs and SROs, various forms of knowledge control, including test tasks, etc.

6.4 Clinical Teams

The programme of training of residents in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" to work in a team and effective interaction with other health care specialists includes direct work of residents together with employees of clinical bases in all spheres of their activity, participation in selector republican and city meetings, in scientific and practical conferences, work in multidisciplinary teams. Residents take an active part in vaccination of the population of the region. Working in multidisciplinary teams when choosing the tactics of managing the most complex patients increases the responsibility of residents when they see that performance depends on the correct organization of team work. In such situations, the resident performs all work within his competence.

The skills of coordination of work with colleagues and other health care specialists in the residents of EP 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" develop during examination, treatment and emergency care of patients. The resident is present during the consultations, fulfills the orders of senior colleagues within his competence. The result of the resident's activity is checked by the teacher.

6.5 Medical Research and Advances

During the reporting period, the staff of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology participated in a number of applied scientific studies. The list of works of the faculty of the department is presented.

Resident of EP 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" has no publications at the time of the external evaluation, did not participate in conferences and other forums.

Resident of EP 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" independently conducts patient supervision, the clinical bases have access to equipment and archived medical records. The department provides residents with appropriate time in the training programme for scientific work.

6.6 Education expertise

Examination of the quality of the implemented EP residency is carried out at the level of the Department, the Committee of Educational Programmes, the Department of Academic Work, the Residency Department, the Department of Strategic Development and QMS, the Academic Council, the Academic Council. The composition of collegial advisory bodies (CEP, AC, SC) includes teachers, representatives of professional associations, employers, students.

Duties of examination in the assessment of education and research in the discipline of medical education are assigned to the department of academic work

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" contributes to the development of the interests of employees in conducting research in education through the training of teaching staff, the participation of teaching staff in various conferences and seminars on medical education.

In order to improve the quality of medical education and to develop and improve the pedagogical and professional competencies of teachers and medical workers, a school for teachers has been set up. Virtually every teacher receives instruction at the School.

6.7 Training in other institutions

In order to organize and implement academic mobility, the department of academic mobility is organized in the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity", which actively works to establish partnerships with Kazakh and foreign universities, conducts policies for their implementation with educational institutions and organizations of the Republic of Belarus, the Kyrgyz Republic, the Russian Federation, Turkey and France. In total, 11 memoranda were signed with medical universities of near and far abroad.

In accordance with the principles of the Bologna process, the University implements the programmes "Academic Mobility of Students". This contributes to the internationalization of education and integration into the world educational space and is in line with the University's Strategic Plan.

To ensure academic mobility of students and recognition of educational programmes (all levels and forms of higher and postgraduate education) in the European educational space, Kazakhstan's loans were converted into ECTS loans.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 17, partially - 4, do not meet - 0

Standard 6: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) It is recommended to establish cooperation with universities of Kazakhstan, near and far abroad. Academic mobility of residents and TS should be planned and implemented.

2) Expand access to UpToDate, Cochrane Library databases to implement EP

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Evidence of compliance:

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

In the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity", the monitoring and evaluation of EP is carried out at all levels, a multilevel approach is used, including the profiling and related departments, the department of residency, the profile CEP of postgraduate education, AWD, the Academic Council, the Scientific Council, the Career Center (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students).

Recruitment of residents in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" was carried out for the first time in 2021, the first graduation of residents in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" is planned in 2023.

Independent assessment of the implementation and achievement of the final learning outcomes (FLO) is carried out by the examination of graduates of the EP through the National Center for Independent Examination (NCIE) and on the questionnaire of employers. This procedure is carried out annually, after which disciplines are introduced into the catalogue of elective disciplines (CED), which allow to strengthen the achievement of the expected final WB

7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

In this regard, the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" observes proper representation of stakeholders in assessing the processes and final results of resident training programmes. The CEP includes heads of the department, professors, associate professors, teachers of departments that provide the educational process in the relevant specialty, representatives of the student population. The composition of the AC, the CEP is approved by the Rector of the University.

The management system of the EP Residency provides for the participation of all stakeholders, including the health sectors, and reflects the responsibility of academic management. This is confirmed by feedback and reviews on the EP.

When conducting the final certification of residents, an attestation commission (AC) is appointed, which includes representatives of practical health care, universities and research institutes.

Employers and practitioners are involved in the discussion of the expected learning outcomes; in the assessment of student learning achievements, educational trajectories. Based on their feedback and recommendations, the key and final competencies of the graduates of the EP residency are formed.

On the website of the university there is information about the available educational programmes (<http://medkrmu.kz/>).

Continuous work is carried out to determine the satisfaction of internal and external consumers of the university. The total number of people surveyed in 2020-2021 academic year is 164 people. The level of satisfaction with clinical practice is 4 points out of 5. There is an Action Plan to Improve the Satisfaction and Expectations of University Consumers Based on the Analysis of the Questionnaire on Student Satisfaction Assessment of the University Learning Environment

For feedback with teachers and residents, the Rector's blog is used, on which students and university staff receive answers to questions they are interested in on the terms of implementation of the educational programme. Representatives of residents are members of the CEP, the Academic Council, where they participate in the discussion of the implementation of the educational programme.

Taking into account feedback from stakeholders: a list of disciplines - mandatory and optional - "electives" has been defined; the content of disciplines for each specialty has been revised from the point of view of the competence approach (practical orientation of training, development of students' independent work skills, their self-knowledge and self-esteem); a technology for credit and hour assessment of educational programmes and the results of their mastering has been developed; the system of final control and assessment of students' knowledge has been improved.

The programme evaluation process involves all stakeholders (faculty, residents, employers) through representation in the relevant structures.

7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

The Residence Department collects feedback from students to determine the level of satisfaction with the content of the EP, the organization of the educational process in the form of a questionnaire, monitoring of appeals to the rector's blog, discussion of current issues in the social network. Monitoring student achievement of learning outcomes plays an important role in the assessment of EP.

The Department of Clinical Pharmacology presents feedback questionnaires from students, representatives of practical health care, teachers of other educational organizations in the form of reviews.

In 2021, the direction of monitoring of the PSC and the Career Center carried out a sociological study "Satisfaction of employers with graduates of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity ". 30 employers (60% response rate) from 6 oblasts and the city of Almaty were interviewed. The results of the survey of employers on the quality of training of graduates of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" for 2021 showed that no employer rated the quality of training as low.

7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

The following are involved in the assessment and improvement of EP at the University: the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan – an independent assessment of the knowledge of residents; the Department of Regional Health Authorities – on the bilateral initiative, agreements on cooperation with the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity", contracts with 85 clinical bases and medical institutions of Almaty and regions; employers (medical institutions of the regional health departments of the Republic) - the creation of an effective system for promoting the employment and adaptation of graduates to the labor market, annually correspondence is conducted on the quality of training of residency graduates, doctors' feedback on the clinical practice of residents is collected; Representatives of the Committee for the Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Services and representatives of practical health care

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity» widely uses the principle of independent objective assessment, involving as chairmen, members and examiners of the certification commission for the final certification of graduates, participate in their distribution. Their opinions and comments are taken into account when planning improvements.

7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" has developed mechanisms for the approval of educational programmes, which provide for the evaluation of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, the process of implementation of EP and progress of residents is monitored, the identification and timely solution of emerging problems is provided.

Examination of the EP is carried out at the level of the CEP for compliance with the SCES, the CEO is approved according to the trajectories of training of a specialist, taking into account pre- and post-requisites, the choice of methods for assessing the results of training of residents is evaluated. The CEP carries out a systematic study and comprehensive assessment of the EP: determination of the value of the programme, achievement of the goal, implementation of tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of the society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of the training methodology, as well as an assessment of the quality of the DQAM, assessment of the quality of the EP in the areas of specialization. An external assessment of EP is carried out by a competent representative of practical health care.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully -15.

Standard 7: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

Evidence of compliance:

8.1 Control

The NEI "KazRosMedUniversity" is guided by the following documents in the implementation of postgraduate education: the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", sub-paragraph 2-1 of Article 5; Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in the residency"; Model rules for admission to training in the organization of education, implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education; State Educational Standard of the residency for medical specialties and a model professional curriculum for medical specialties of the residency, approved by the order of the acting Ministry of Health and Social Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 No.647 (with amendments and additions dated February 21, 2020).

Enrolment of citizens to the target places under the state educational order for the training of specialists in the residency is carried out on a competitive basis, which is carried out separately among persons applying for the target places. A tripartite agreement is concluded with each student of the residency who has received a state educational order within the framework of targeted training "University – Health Department or a medical and preventive institution – a student of the residency.

The Residency Department coordinates, monitors and monitors the implementation of the Residency programmes in all licensed specialties under the supervision of the Vice-Rector for Clinical Activities.

Assessment of residents and achievement of the final results of training under the residency programme is carried out on the basis of the final state certification.

It follows from this that the NEI "KazRosmedunivreshet" implements the EP for residency in accordance with the regulations approved by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as the internal rules for the organization of the educational process in the residency

8.2 Academic Leadership

Management of the educational process, including at the postgraduate level, is carried out in accordance with the organizational structure of the NEI "KazRosMedUniversity". The executive body of the University is its Rector. The Rector of the University is personally responsible for the financial and economic activities, the safety of the University property, for the organization of anti-corruption, establishes the competence of vice-rectors and other senior employees of the University, decides all issues of the University in accordance with its competence determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Direct management of resident programmes and coordination of resident activities since the existence of the resident programme is carried out by the Resident Department. The main purpose of the department is to carry out continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and purpose of educational programmes, including residency in the accredited specialty. The department reports directly to the vice-rector for scientific and clinical activities, the rector.

The activities of the Residency Department are managed by the head appointed to the position by the order of the rector. The Division is responsible for the following decisions: development and approval of the mission programmes, rules for the organization of the learning process in the resident office, recommendations for the recruitment of residents, training of residents. The Department monitors residents, maintains relations with the practical health care sector and resident alumni, interacts with other structural units of the University involved in the implementation and support of resident programmes (AWD, DP&CEP, DIT).

The goal of the CEP is to improve educational programmes in disciplines, improve the educational process.

The Academic Council organizes and considers the introduction of various forms of methodological work aimed at improving the educational process.

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The budget of KazRosmeduniversity is formed from two sources: the republican budget (state order for training of personnel of higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and provision of paid educational services.

The faculty is the main resource for ensuring the mission of KazRosmeduniversity. In this regard, the University pays special attention to the processes of recruitment and training of personnel.

Teachers, doctors and candidates of sciences, specialists of practical health care are invited to KazRosMedUniversity to improve the quality of teaching, to ensure close connection with practical health care.

8.4 Administration and Management

KazRosMedUniversity annually introduces changes and additions to the organizational structure. The staffing table of departments/courses providing educational programmes of the residency is approved annually taking into account changes in the number of students. According to Art.52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated 27.07.2007. No. 319-III, the total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of an average ratio of residents and teachers – 3:1.

The calculation of the pedagogical load of the teaching staff is carried out in accordance with the Standard Rules for the Activities of Higher Education Organizations and the State Education Standard and is approved at the meeting of the Academic Council of the University

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The mechanism of interaction of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", as a state medical higher education institution, with the authorized bodies (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan) and the health sector is regulated by: the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; the implementation of State programmes, Decrees and orders; contracts and agreements with health management bodies; contracts and agreements with health care organizations; written appeals of authorized state bodies and medical organizations.

The choice of the specialty of residency is regulated by the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. KR DSM-116 dated August 28, 2019 "On placement of a state educational order for training in medical and pharmaceutical specialties with postgraduate education for the 2019-2020 academic year"

For the development of residency programmes, their improvement, representatives of practical health care are involved. In order to effectively plan, develop and implement residency programmes, the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" included representatives of practical health care, residents and teachers of departments involved in the implementation of residency programmes in the advisory bodies (CEP, AS). Each of these representatives has the right to vote when making changes, proposals and comments in the educational process of the residency. As well as the right to vote in the approval of educational programmes for residency.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 15 standards conform: fully -14, partially – 1.

Standard 8: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) It is recommended to improve financing mechanisms for the development of academic mobility of faculty and residents, participation in international events, publication activity.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Evidence of compliance:

The University has a sufficient material and technical base for the training of students of the residency in the specialty 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology";

to master clinical competencies, the University provides EP with clinical bases in accordance with the level of medical care (PHC, hospital), the profile of patients of different ages;

the university provides opportunities for independent training of students (IWS) providing access to educational resources of the library and the Internet;

direct joint activity of residency students with employees of clinical bases in all spheres of their activity, at all stages of the provision of qualified and specialized medical care.

- Continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and objective;

- Transparency of the management system and decision-making;

- Sustainable financial condition of the university;

- Extensive cooperation with partners in the health sector.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 4 standards: fully – 4.

Standard 9: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme: 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology"

1. It is recommended to specify the training methods, revise the assessment methods and use the assessment sheets corresponding to the profile of the specialty (2.4)
2. It is necessary to improve the methodology for evaluating test tasks for reliability, validity using appropriate programmes (2.4)
3. Include resident association representatives in resident admission and selection policy development (4.3)
4. It is recommended to establish cooperation with universities of Kazakhstan, near and far abroad. Academic mobility of residents and TS should be planned and implemented (6.5)
5. Expand access to UpToDate, Cochrane Library (6.4) databases to implement the EP
6. Improve the financing mechanism for the development of academic mobility of faculty and residents, participation in international events, publication activity (8.3)

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the ECAQA established the compliance of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich
Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov
Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Kudabaeva Khatima Ilyasovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhunosova Aigul Bitimbayevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tuleutaeva Raykhan Esenzhanovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tezekbaev Kanat Mardenovich
Kazakh Academic Expert	Rakhmanov Eltai Utemuratovich
Employers' representative	Zhazira Dzhumabekovna Moldabaeva
Resident Representative	Ermekbai Abay Amanzholuly

Observer for ECAQA M.A. Umarova


















**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme
(generalization)**

Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Estimation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMME	31	31		
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	7	4	
4.	STUDENTS	30	29	1	
5.	FACULTY	7	7		
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	17	4	
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15		
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	14	1	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4		
	Subtotal:	151	141	10	
			151		

List of documents studied by the members of the EEC as part of the external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01142 – "Clinical Pharmacology"

№	Names of documents	Quantity	Date of approval
1.	Personnel policy	1	25.12.2020
2.	Regulations on social support for students	1	21.06.2019
3.	Regulations on the Commission for ensuring the academic quality of the educational programme	1	26.08.2021
4.	Regulation on the Test Committee	1	28.10.2021
5.	Rules for admission to the residency	1	24.07.2020
6.	Regulations on on-site training in internship and residency	1	29.08.2019
7.	Teacher Honor Code	1	12.12.2017
8.	Regulations on the Organization of Training with the Use of Distance Education Technologies	1	29.08.2019
9.	Regulation on the Board of Curators	1	18.11.2019
10.	Regulation on the assessment of students' knowledge	1	29.08.2019
11.	Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students	1	29.08.2019
12.	Rules for Granting Academic Leave to Students	1	29.08.2019
13.	Code of Academic Integrity	1	27.04.2019
14.	Rules of Internal Regulations for Students	1	29.08.2019
15.	Regulations on the Committee for Educational Programmes	1	29.08.2019
16.	Rules for using the "Anti-plagiarism. University" system	1	29.08.2019
17.	Regulation on the processing, protection and storage of personal data of employees and students	1	17.06.2019
18.	Clinical Instructor Statement	1	17.06.2019
19.	Academic Policy	1	27.08.2021
20.	EP 7R01142 – Clinical Pharmacology	1	18.08.2021
21.	Syllabuses	4	31.08.2021